
NYISO Business Issues Committee Meeting Minutes
December 14, 2016
10:00 a.m. – 3:15 p.m.

1. Introductions, Meeting Objectives, and Chairman's Report

Mr. Scott Butler (Consolidated Edison) called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. by welcoming the members of the BIC. The members of the BIC identified themselves and attendance was recorded. A quorum was determined.

2. Approval of BIC Minutes

There were no comments or questions regarding the draft minutes for the October 20, 2016 meeting that were included with the meeting material.

Motion #1:

Motion to approve the October 20, 2016 BIC meeting minutes.

Motion passed unanimously.

3. Market Operations & Broader Regional Markets Report

Mr. Rana Mukerji (NYISO) reviewed the presentations included with the meeting material. There were no comments or questions on the Market Operations report.

With respect to the Broader Regional Markets report, Mr. Mark Younger (Hudson Energy Economics) asked if the NYISO has the appropriate software in place to address the necessary changes required by FERC Order No. 831 (addressing changes to offer caps). Ms. Kelli Joseph (NRG) asked if the automated mitigation software is prepared to address the changes required by the order. Mr. Mukerji noted that the NYISO was continuing to assess the software revisions that may be necessary to implement the order. Mr. Mukerji also noted that the NYISO would likely seek clarification and/or rehearing with respect to certain aspects of the order that appear more appropriate for *ex post* markets and not the *ex ante* markets administered by the NYISO.

4. Broader Regional Planning Report

Mr. Dana Walters (NYISO) provided a verbal update on notable planning related activities. NYISO presented its plan for the 2016 CRP study at the December 7, 2016 ESPWG. NYISO has completed an additional CARIS study for Empire Connector transmission project, which assessed the economic impact of a new transmission facility connecting Marcy and NYC. PPL Electric Utilities has also requested an additional CARIS study to be performed, assessing the economic impact of a new transmission facility connecting Lackawanna, PA and Ramapo, NY. This additional CARIS study is ongoing. NYISO staff continues to internally assess appropriate metrics for estimating the capacity benefits of public policy transmission project proposals, as well as other potential metrics of assessing project impacts. On December 5, 2016 NYISO submitted comments to the New York State Public Service Commission (NYSPSC) supporting a finding of a need for additional transmission to assist in meeting the State's Clean Energy Standard (CES) goals and bring output from renewable resources located in northern New York to load centers in southeast New York. If the NYSPSC ultimately determines that there is a need for transmission, the NYISO will solicit projects from developers to fulfill any such identified needs. The NYISO is in the process of finalizing its Clean Power Plan report, which will provide input to the State's planning process on issues relating to electric system reliability, electric system efficiency, and emissions. The results of Phase 1 of the NYISO's study were reported to the ESPWG on July 5, 2016. Phase 2 of the study will include a resource adequacy analysis for the year 2030 and will be issued as part of the final report by the end of the year. At the December 9, 2016 IPSAC meeting, it was determined that there were no proposed interconnection projects that may have interregional impacts.

5. Balance-of-Period TCC (BoP) Auctions

Mr. Curt Devenitch (NYISO) reviewed the presentation included with the meeting material.

Mr. Mike Kramek (Boston Energy Trading) stated that the NYISO should focus on a June 2017 implementation date. He also urged the NYISO to come back in January 2017 with more detailed information on the testing schedule. Mr. Greg Williams (NYISO) stated that the current expectation is for the software deployment to occur in June 2017 to implement the auction functionality and related credit requirement changes and for the NYISO to begin conducting balance-of-period auctions in the late summer.

Motion #2:

The Business Issues Committee (“BIC”) hereby recommends that the Management Committee approve changes to the NYISO’s Market Administration and Control Area Services Tariff (MST) and Open Access Transmission Tariff (OATT) related to the Balance-of-Period TCC Auction proposal, as more fully described in the presentation entitled “Balance-of-Period TCC Auctions” made to the BIC on December 14, 2016.

Motion passed unanimously.

6. Coordinating without the Con Ed/PSEG Wheel

Mr. Ethan Avallone (NYISO) reviewed the presentation included with the meeting material.

Mr. Howard Fromer (PSEG) asked for confirmation that this was a near-term proposal and not intended to foreclose ability to put different equipment on the lines to allow them to be used as individually scheduled lines in the future or to foreclose the opportunity to develop alternative rules in the future. Mr. Avallone confirmed that Mr. Fromer’s understanding was correct.

Mr. Kevin Lang (Couch White) raised a concern regarding the equity to NY ratepayers in regards to the Operational Base Flow (OBF) aspect of the proposal. Specifically, Mr. Lang noted that there should not be adverse financial impacts to NY ratepayers if the NYISO is unable to accommodate the OBF for reliability reasons. Mr. Liam Baker (EasternGen) and Ms. Jane Quinn (Con Edison) noted that they concurred with the equity concerns raised by Mr. Lang. Mr. Dimitri Kordonis (NY UIU) asked if there could be any changes to the OBF during the five years before sunset. Ms. Emilie Nelson (NYISO) explained that proposed tariff language allows NYISO and PJM to mutually agree to different OBF value without requiring a stakeholder vote on such a change. Ms. Nelson clarified that if a new construct were developed in the future, new revisions would be required to incorporate such a construct into the Joint Operating Agreement (JOA), which would require proceeding through the normal stakeholder process to approve any such changes. Ms. Doreen Saia (Greenburg Traurig) asked for confirmation that absent issues arising once the new construct is implemented, the NYISO is not intended to assess other possible solutions. Ms. Nelson confirmed that Ms. Saia’s understanding was correct. Mr. Younger asked if the OBF could be revised as part of the annual review process if it became apparent that transmission upgrades would lead to a change in the amount required. Ms. Nelson confirmed that this could be the case.

Ms. Quinn stated that Con Edison continues to have concerns with the proposed tariff language in that it does not appear to provide for parity between PJM and NYISO or adequate flexibility to address future changes in conditions that could arise. Mr. Fromer asked if additional potential changes to the tariff language could be assessed between BIC and the Management Committee meeting, while still allowing BIC to act on the proposal today. Ms. Nelson expressed the importance of proceeding with a vote today due to the urgency of getting a revised construct in place by May 2017. Ms. Nelson agreed that the NYISO will reach out to PJM to discuss potential additional refinements to the proposed tariff language prior to the Management Committee meeting.

Motion #3:

Market participants raised concerns regarding OBF reciprocity and the need for a limitation of liability in the event the NYISO cannot reliably provide the initial OBF under the Joint Operating Agreement revisions between the NYISO and PJM. The market participants have asked the NYISO to consider certain revisions to that Agreement to address these concerns and better protect the NYISO’s and its market participants’ interests, and the NYISO has expressed a willingness to do so. Accordingly, the Business Issues Committee (“BIC”) hereby provides conceptual approval for revisions to the Joint Operating Agreement between the NYISO and PJM related to the Coordinating without the ConEd/PSEG Wheel proposal described in the presentation entitled “Coordinating without the ConEd/PSEG Wheel” made to the BIC on December 14, 2016, and conceptual approval that there is a need for associated changes to the NYISO’s Market Administration and Control Area Services Tariff (MST) and the Open Access Transmission Tariff (OATT).

The NYISO shall report to the Management Committee on any modifications that have been or will be agreed to with PJM, as well as on any additional revisions to the tariff changes discussed at the BIC meeting that are needed to reflect such modifications.

Motion passed with abstentions.

7. FERC Order 825 Settlement Intervals & Shortage Pricing Update

Mr. Avallone provided a verbal report indicating that the NYISO believes it is already in compliance with the requirements of Order No. 825 and will demonstrate such compliance in its required filing to FERC in response to the order. There were no questions or comments regarding Mr. Avallone's report.

8. BSM Forecast Enhancements – NYISO Concept Proposal

Mr. Michael Lavilotti (NYISO) reviewed the presentation included with the meeting material.

Mr. Younger sought clarification on whether a generator that is currently operating and has issued a retirement notice would meet the inclusion test because it would not need to make any repairs to keep operating. Mr. Lavilotti confirmed that such a unit would pass the inclusion test if there was no need for significant repair.

Mr. Lang asked how a unit relinquishing or transferring CRIS rights could be in service, but not be in the forecast. Mr. Lorenzo Seirup (NYISO) noted that in the case of one unit relinquishing or transferring CRIS rights to another unit in a Class Year study there is a need to avoid "double counting" of the capacity related to the transfer. Therefore, only one of the two units associated with the transfer should be accounted for in the forecast.

Mr. Younger asked how out of market payments get reflected in the forecast. Mr. Seirup noted that the inclusion test is not limited to solely considering NYISO market revenues. Mr. Younger requested clarification regarding when the NYISO would recognize that a unit may not be leaving because there are state policies to retain a unit. Mr. Shaun Johnson (NYISO) said the NYISO would look at outside sources of revenue only in the sense that those units have firm commitments/contracts.

Mr. Alan Michaels (NYS DPS) sought clarification regarding the purpose of the inclusion test. Mr. Lavilotti said the test is meant to forecast the economic conditions for the mitigation study period associated with a given the class year and which units should be included or excluded from the forecast for that period.

Ms. Joseph (NRG) asked if the test was a one-time snap shot or whether the test could be revised in light of new information that may become available. Mr. Seirup noted that the NYISO works to keep its analysis as up to date as possible. Ms. Saia sought clarification on whether the NYISO would update the test within a Class Year study period or only update from one Class Year study to the next. Mr. Seirup said if a Class Year is in progress, the NYISO would keep it updated as the Class Year continues.

Mr. Fromer expressed a concern about subjectivity and noted the benefits to bright line definitions/tests. He said that subjectivity could lead to parties fighting over why certain assumptions were made.

Mr. Lang sought clarification regarding whether the NYISO would limit its considerations to only publicly available information or also consider other non-public information that may be available to it. Mr. Seirup noted that the NYISO would use publicly available information or other information that the NYISO could verify, which could include generator specific confidential information it has received.

Ms. Saia and Mr. Younger sought clarification on how the NYISO's proposal would apply to UDRs. Mr. Seirup said if a UDR was in an outage state similar to the generator outage states, the NYISO would want to use the same process to understand the cost to for that UDR to return to service in determining whether to include it in the forecast.

Mr. Fromer asked if there was an assumption made that an RMR unit leaves the market at the end of the RMR agreement or does the NYISO look at new circumstances and new information. Mr. Lavilotti said it would be a case-by-case determination based on available information.

Mr. John Borchert (Central Hudson) said the New York Transmission Owners (TOs) have concerns with the economic test and whether the NYISO will have the forecasting capability and insight to effectively do an economic test, as well as whether such a test is appropriate. Specifically, Mr. Borchert recommended that the NYISO further assess eliminating the economic test or significant modification of that test so it becomes more of a bright line prior to bringing a proposal forward to the Management Committee. Mr. Borchert noted that the TOs are in favor of the improvement of the inclusion test and feel that this is a step in the right direction. Mr. Lang agreed with the TOs, but also noted his concerns with the economic test.

Ms. Saia said that, for suppliers, the economic test is a critical aspect of assessing whether the proposal could be tenable. Ms. Saia noted that under the current rules generators are modeled as in unless retired. She further noted that it is important to recognize a generator's 3 year CRIS rights period. Prematurely presuming generators are leaving and modeling them as out in the forecast could produce inaccurate results.

Mr. Raghu Palavadi Naga (Market Monitoring Unit) noted his appreciation for the NYISO's efforts to develop reasonable rules and generally agreed with the overall direction of the proposal, but noted two concerns. Mr. Palavadi Naga noted that the proposal should: (i) incorporate an exclusion test to allow existing units to exit the market when forecasted capacity prices are too low; and (ii) specify how the NYISO will prioritize the assessment of new and existing units. Mr. Johnson said the NYISO was in agreement with the concept of developing an exclusion test, but noted that this would be pursued as a separate initiative. Mr. Younger raised concerns about the implications of potential out of market actions to retain units as it relates to any further discussions regarding an exclusion test.

Motion #4

The Business Issues Committee ("BIC") hereby recommends that the Management Committee approve changes to the NYISO's Market Administration and Control Area Services Tariff related to the Buyer Side Mitigation Forecast Enhancement proposal, subject to the development of tariff revisions for UDRs where noted in a manner that is consistent with the provisions associated with generators in the forecast, as more fully described in the presentation made to the BIC on December 14, 2016.

Motion failed with 43.21% affirmative votes.

Motion #4a

Motion to amend motion 4:

The Business Issues Committee ("BIC") hereby recommends that the Management Committee approve changes to the NYISO's Market Administration and Control Area Services Tariff related to the Buyer Side Mitigation Forecast Enhancement proposal, subject to further development of tariff revisions for UDRs and the inclusion test.

Motion failed with 49.78% affirmative votes.

9. Business Issues Committee Organization

Mr. Scott Butler reviewed the presentation included with the meeting material. The group discussed: (i) combining the BAWG and CPWG into one group; and (ii) eliminating the IPTF by including its scope of work within the ESPWG.

Mr. Butler also proposed a new working group to address certain public policy integration discussions, such as the Distributed Energy Resources (DER) Roadmap and the 2017 Public Policy Integration initiative. Mr. Lang, Mr. Bob Boyle (NYPA), Mr. Chris Hall (NYSERDA), Mr. Chris LaRoe (Brookfield), Ms. Radina Valova (PACE), Mr. Miles Farmer (NRDC) and Mr. Greg Geller (EnerNOC) noted support for the concept as an efficient way of addressing certain topics with cross-market implications in a single forum. Mr. Younger expressed concern about holding discussions related to the energy market outside of the MIWG and the capacity market outside the ICAPWG.

Mr. Butler requested that any additional comments on the proposal be provided by December 21, 2016 and noted that additional discussions would take place at the January 2017 BIC meeting.

10. New Business

There was no new business.

Meeting adjourned at 3:15 p.m.

Business Issues Committee Meeting

December 14, 2016

Final Motions

Motion #1:

Motion to approve the October 20, 2016 BIC meeting minutes.

Motion passed unanimously.

Motion #2:

The Business Issues Committee (“BIC”) hereby recommends that the Management Committee approve changes to the NYISO’s Market Administration and Control Area Services Tariff (MST) and Open Access Transmission Tariff (OATT) related to the Balance-of-Period TCC Auction proposal, as more fully described in the presentation entitled “Balance-of-Period TCC Auctions” made to the BIC on December 14, 2016.

Motion passed unanimously.

Motion #3:

Market participants raised concerns regarding OBF reciprocity and the need for a limitation of liability in the event the NYISO cannot reliably provide the initial OBF under the Joint Operating Agreement revisions between the NYISO and PJM. The market participants have asked the NYISO to consider certain revisions to that Agreement to address these concerns and better protect the NYISO’s and its market participants’ interests, and the NYISO has expressed a willingness to do so. Accordingly, the Business Issues Committee (“BIC”) hereby provides conceptual approval for revisions to the Joint Operating Agreement between the NYISO and PJM related to the Coordinating without the ConEd/PSEG Wheel proposal described in the presentation entitled “Coordinating without the ConEd/PSEG Wheel” made to the BIC on December 14, 2016, and conceptual approval that there is a need for associated changes to the NYISO’s Market Administration and Control Area Services Tariff (MST) and the Open Access Transmission Tariff (OATT). The NYISO shall report to the Management Committee on any modifications that have been or will be agreed to with PJM, as well as on any additional revisions to the tariff changes discussed at the BIC meeting that are needed to reflect such modifications.

Motion passed with abstentions.

Motion #4

The Business Issues Committee (“BIC”) hereby recommends that the Management Committee approve changes to the NYISO’s Market Administration and Control Area Services Tariff related to the Buyer Side Mitigation Forecast Enhancement proposal, subject to the development of tariff revisions for UDRs where noted in a manner that is

consistent with the provisions associated with generators in the forecast, as more fully described in the presentation made to the BIC on December 14, 2016.

Motion failed with 43.21% affirmative votes.

Motion #4a

Motion to amend motion 4:

The Business Issues Committee (“BIC”) hereby recommends that the Management Committee approve changes to the NYISO’s Market Administration and Control Area Services Tariff related to the Buyer Side Mitigation Forecast Enhancement proposal, subject to [further development of tariff revisions for UDRs and the inclusion test.](#) ~~the development of tariff revisions for UDRs where noted in a manner that is consistent with the provisions associated with generators in the forecast, as more fully described in the presentation made to the BIC on December 14, 2016.~~

Motion failed with 49.78% affirmative votes.

New York Independent System Operator

Business Issues Committee - December 14, 2016

Motion: Motion #Motion to Amend

Result: Motion Failed

Sector with base percent	%	Active	Quorum	Adj. Percent	For	Against	Abstain	% For	% Against	
Generation Owners	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	0.00	5.00	0.00	0.00	21.50	
Other Suppliers	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	0.00	6.00	6.00	0.00	21.50	
Transmission Owners	20.00	✓	✓	20.00	3.00	0.00	1.00	20.00	0.00	
End Use Consumer			✓							
Large Consumer	9.00	✓		11.24	0.00	0.00	4.00	0.00	0.00	
Large Cons. Gov. Agency	2.00	✓		2.50	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
Small Consumer	4.50	✓	✗	0.64	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	
Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	2.70	✓		3.37	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	
Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	1.80	✓		2.25	2.00	0.00	0.00	5.62	0.00	
Public Power			✓							
State Power Authorities	8.00	✓		8.00	2.00	0.00	0.00	9.07	0.00	
Munis & Co-ops	7.00	✓		7.00	8.00	0.00	0.00	7.93	0.00	
Environmental	2.00	✓		2.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	
				5	100.00	15.00	11.00	14.00	42.62	43.00
					100.00	Normalize to 100% :		49.78	50.22	

New York Independent System Operator

Business Issues Committee - December 14, 2016

Motion: Motion #Motion to Amend

Result: Motion Failed

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Generation Owners	Indeck Energy Services, Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Astoria Energy LLC	Schwall, Matthew	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Calpine		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	CPV Valley LLC	Schwall, Matthew	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	East Coast Power, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Entergy Nuclear Northeast	Saia, Doreen	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Innovative Energy Systems		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Noble Environmental Power LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Selkirk Cogen Partners, LP		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	TC Ravenswood, Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	EDP Renewables North America LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Cricket Valley Energy Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Invenergy Energy Management LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	National Grid Generation LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Somerset Operating Company, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Howard Wind LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BJ Energy LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Citigroup Energy Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Con Edison Solutions Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Constellation New Energy		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Cross Sound Cable Company, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DC Energy		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DTE Energy	German, Robert	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Spectrum		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EnerNoc		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Galt Power	Ackerman, Alan	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	HQ Energy Services US	Plante, Matthieu	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Integrays Energy Services of New York, Inc		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NRG Power Marketing Inc.	Joseph, Kelli	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Ontario Power Generation, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Exelon Generating Co. LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	PSEG Energy Resource & Trade, LLC	Fromer, Howard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	SESCO Enterprises, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Shell Energy North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	TransCanada Power Marketing, Ltd.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BP Energy Company		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EDF Trading North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NextEra Energy		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Innoventive Power		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Vitol Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	GDF Suez Energy NA, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Viridity Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Riverbay Corporation		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Castleton Commodities Merchant Trading L.P.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	BlueRock Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Noble Americas Gas & Power Corp.	Sunga, Leonard	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Lyonsdale Biomass, LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Other Suppliers	Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Technology Savings		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Mercuria Energy America, Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	New York Transco		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Talen Energy		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	CPower	Lawrence, David	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	XO Energy NY, LP		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Dynergy Marketing and Trade	Roby, Rick	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Brookfield Energy Marketing L.P.	LaRoe, Chris	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Eastern Generation	Baker, Liam	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Transmission Owners	New York State Electric & Gas (NYSEG)	Brophy, Richard	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corp.	Borchert, John	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Consolidated Edison Co. of NY, Inc.	Quin, Jane	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	National Grid	Carron, Benjamin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Orange & Rockland Utilities, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Rochester Gas and Electric Corp.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Alcoa, Inc.	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	IBM Corporation	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Occidental Chemical Corp.	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Wegmans Food Markets	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Nucor Steel Auburn, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Cons. Gov. Agency	Metropolitan Transportation Authority		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	American Sugar Refining, Inc		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Beth Israel Health Care System		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Fordham University		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Memorial Sloan Kettering Cancer Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Mount Sinai Medical Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	New York University		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Association for Energy Affordability	Strauss, Valerie	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	Utility Intervention Unit, Division of Consumer Protection, NY Dept. of State	Kordonis, Dimitrios	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	NYS Energy Research & Dev. Authority	Hall, Christopher	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	City of New York	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	Long Island Power Authority	Clarke, Dave	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	New York Power Authority	Lundin, Tim	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Bath Electric, Gas & Water Systems	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Freeport Electric		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Jamestown Board of Public Utilities		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Lake Placid Village	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Municipal Commission of Boonville	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Plattsburgh Municipal Lighting Dept	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Westfield	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Solvay	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Arcade	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Fairport	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Rockville Centre		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Lung Association		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Wind Energy Association		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Environmental Advocates		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Natural Resources Defense Council		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	PACE Energy & Climate Center	Valova, Radina	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Riverkeeper		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Environmental Defense Fund		N	N	0.00	0.00

New York Independent System Operator

Business Issues Committee - December 14, 2016

Motion: Motion #Original Motion

Result: Motion Failed

Sector with base percent	%	Active	Quorum	Adj. Percent	For	Against	Abstain	% For	% Against	
Generation Owners	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	0.00	2.00	3.00	0.00	21.50	
Other Suppliers	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	0.00	4.00	8.00	0.00	21.50	
Transmission Owners	20.00	✓	✓	20.00	3.00	0.00	1.00	20.00	0.00	
End Use Consumer			✓							
Large Consumer	9.00	✓		11.24	0.00	0.00	4.00	0.00	0.00	
Large Cons. Gov. Agency	2.00	✓		2.50	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
Small Consumer	4.50	✓	X	0.64	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	
Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	2.70	✓		3.37	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	
Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	1.80	✓		2.25	0.00	1.00	1.00	0.00	5.62	
Public Power			✓							
State Power Authorities	8.00	✓		8.00	2.00	0.00	0.00	9.07	0.00	
Munis & Co-ops	7.00	✓		7.00	8.00	0.00	0.00	7.93	0.00	
Environmental	2.00	✓		2.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	
				5	100.00	13.00	7.00	20.00	37.00	48.62
					100.00	Normalize to 100% :		43.21	56.79	

New York Independent System Operator

Business Issues Committee - December 14, 2016

Motion: Motion #Original Motion

Result: Motion Failed

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Generation Owners	Indeck Energy Services, Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	Astoria Energy LLC	Schwall, Matthew	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Calpine		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	CPV Valley LLC	Schwall, Matthew	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	East Coast Power, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Entergy Nuclear Northeast	Saia, Doreen	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Innovative Energy Systems		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Noble Environmental Power LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Selkirk Cogen Partners, LP		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	TC Ravenswood, Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	EDP Renewables North America LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Cricket Valley Energy Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Invenergy Energy Management LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	National Grid Generation LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Somerset Operating Company, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Howard Wind LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BJ Energy LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Citigroup Energy Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Con Edison Solutions Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Constellation New Energy		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Cross Sound Cable Company, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DC Energy		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DTE Energy	German, Robert	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Spectrum		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EnerNoc		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Galt Power	Ackerman, Alan	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	HQ Energy Services US	Plante, Matthieu	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Integrus Energy Services of New York, Inc		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NRG Power Marketing Inc.	Joseph, Kelli	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Ontario Power Generation, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Exelon Generating Co. LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	PSEG Energy Resource & Trade, LLC	Fromer, Howard	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	SESCO Enterprises, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Shell Energy North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	TransCanada Power Marketing, Ltd.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BP Energy Company		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EDF Trading North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NextEra Energy		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Innoventive Power		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Vitol Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	GDF Suez Energy NA, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Viridity Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Riverbay Corporation		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Castleton Commodities Merchant Trading L.P.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	BlueRock Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Noble Americas Gas & Power Corp.	Sunga, Leonard	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Lyonsdale Biomass, LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Other Suppliers	Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Technology Savings		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Mercuria Energy America, Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	New York Transco		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Talen Energy		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	CPower	Lawrence, David	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	XO Energy NY, LP		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Dynergy Marketing and Trade	Roby, Rick	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Brookfield Energy Marketing L.P.	LaRoe, Chris	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	Eastern Generation	Baker, Liam	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	New York State Electric & Gas (NYSEG)	Brophy, Richard	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corp.	Borchert, John	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Consolidated Edison Co. of NY, Inc.	Quin, Jane	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	National Grid	Carron, Benjamin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Orange & Rockland Utilities, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Rochester Gas and Electric Corp.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Alcoa, Inc.	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	IBM Corporation	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Occidental Chemical Corp.	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Wegmans Food Markets	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Nucor Steel Auburn, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Cons. Gov. Agency	Metropolitan Transportation Authority		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	American Sugar Refining, Inc		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Beth Israel Health Care System		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Fordham University		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Memorial Sloan Kettering Cancer Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Mount Sinai Medical Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	New York University		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Association for Energy Affordability	Strauss, Valerie	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	Utility Intervention Unit, Division of Consumer Protection, NY Dept. of State	Kordonis, Dimitrios	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	NYS Energy Research & Dev. Authority	Hall, Christopher	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	City of New York	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	Long Island Power Authority	Clarke, Dave	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	New York Power Authority	Lundin, Tim	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Bath Electric, Gas & Water Systems	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Freeport Electric		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Jamestown Board of Public Utilities		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Lake Placid Village	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Municipal Commission of Boonville	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Plattsburgh Municipal Lighting Dept	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Westfield	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Solvay	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Arcade	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Fairport	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Rockville Centre		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Lung Association		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Wind Energy Association		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Environmental Advocates		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Natural Resources Defense Council		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	PACE Energy & Climate Center	Valova, Radina	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Riverkeeper		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Environmental Defense Fund		N	N	0.00	0.00

New York Independent System Operator - Committee Membership

Business Issues Committee - December 14, 2016 - NYISO - Parties Checked in Attendance

Organization	Sector	Representative	Alternate1	Alternate2	Alternate3	Alternate4	Alternate5	Alternate6	Alternate7	Proxy	Guest
Astoria Energy LLC	Generation Owners	McCall, Chuck	Browne , Scott	Habib , Phillipe	Singer, Leonard					✓Schwall, Matthew	
CPV Valley LLC	Generation Owners	Litchfield , Matt	Rumsey , Tom							✓Schwall, Matthew	
Calpine	Generation Owners	Kruse, Brett	Reitmeyer , Jay	Flumerfelt, John	Schleimer , Steve						
Cricket Valley Energy Center	Generation Owners	De Meyere , Bob	Wallenstein , Arnold	Paryl , Ron							
EDP Renewables North America LLC	Generation Owners	Brodbeck , John	Kaplan , Seth	Nemeth , Jeffrey	High , Jeremy						
East Coast Power, LLC	Generation Owners	Shanker, Roy	Fogarty , Thomas	Lee , Tina	Franzetti , Paul						
Entergy Nuclear Northeast	Generation Owners	Potkin , Marc	Dell Orto , Ken	✓Saia, Doreen	Bergeron , John						
Howard Wind LLC	Generation Owners	Merich , Olivia	Rugh , Chris								
Indeck Energy Services, Inc.	Generation Owners	Ferguson, Mike	✓Younger, Mark								
Innovative Energy Systems	Generation Owners	Zeliff, Peter	Henningham, Scott								
Invenergy Energy Management LLC	Generation Owners	Ma , Alex	Goldstein , Michael	Orzel , Chris							
National Grid Generation LLC	Generation Owners	Kain , Terrence	McCabe , Brian								
Noble Environmental Power LLC	Generation Owners	Silton , Harry									
Selkirk Cogen Partners, LP	Generation Owners	Biittig, Timothy	Ryan , James								
Somerset Operating Company, LLC	Generation Owners	Evanoski , Dave	Goodenough , Jeery	McManus , John							
TC Ravenswood, Inc.	Generation Owners	Taylor, William	DAndrea , James	Congel, Dan	Hachey, Mike					✓Younger, Mark	
BJ Energy LLC	Other Suppliers	Ni, Bing	Lee, George								
BP Energy Company	Other Suppliers	Briscoe , Judy	Magruder , Kathy								
BlueRock Energy, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Nichols , Jim	Yeager , Keith	VanHorne , Phil	Graham , Tammy						
Brookfield Energy Marketing L.P.	Other Suppliers	✓LaRoe , Chris	Mitreski , Aleksandar	Mitelman , Rimma	Dallaire , Eric						
CPower	Other Suppliers	Hourihan , Michael	✓Lawrence , David	Damaskos , Deno	Campbell , Bruce	Markham , Craig					
Castleton Commodities Merchant Trading L.P.	Other Suppliers	Stuss , Gordon	Romine , Brad	Emmett , Robert						✓Younger, Mark	
Citigroup Energy Inc.	Other Suppliers	Trayers, Barry									
Con Edison Solutions Inc.	Other Suppliers	✓Mah, Norman	Dannels , Jeff								
Constellation New Energy	Other Suppliers	Wentlent, Chris	Kirk , Steven								
Cross Sound Cable Company, LLC	Other Suppliers	Reinhart, Brian	Rotger, Jose								
DC Energy	Other Suppliers	Bleiweis, Bruce	Stevens, Andrew	Tate, Matthew	Milberg, Sadao	Jeev , Kumar					
DTE Energy	Other Suppliers	Pakela, Gregory	Wieszczyk, Raymond	✓German , Robert							
Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC	Other Suppliers	Philips , Marjorie	Comstock , Read								
Dynegy Marketing and Trade	Other Suppliers	✓Roby , Rick	Ellis, Dean	Ziegler , Pete							
EDF Trading North America, LLC	Other Suppliers	Erbrick , Michael	LeForce , Randall								
Eastern Generation	Other Suppliers	✓Baker, Liam	Reese, John	✓Younger, Mark	✓Schwall , Matthew	✓Johnson , David	Wolcott , Tyler				
EnerNoc	Other Suppliers	Brewster, David	Breidenbaugh, Aaron	Geller , Greg							
Energy Spectrum	Other Suppliers	David, Gary	Ahrens, David	Neiburg, David	Iskowitz, Aron	Brown, Ruben	Pentland , William	Villegas , Cristina	Cinadr , Matt		
Energy Technology Savings	Other Suppliers	Hendler , Jeff	Ross , Valerie								
Exelon Generating Co. LLC	Other Suppliers	Wentlent, Chris	Kirk , Steven								
GDF Suez Energy NA, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Levine , Jeffrey	Hawkins , Darin	Campbell , Chad							
Galt Power	Other Suppliers	Fernands , Rochelle	✓Ackerman, Alan								
HQ Energy Services US	Other Suppliers	✓Plante , Matthieu	Leuthauser, Scott	Guilbault , Louis							
Innoventive Power	Other Suppliers	Gruber , Craig	Halford , Steve								
Integrus Energy Services of New York, Inc	Other Suppliers	Haugh, Michael									
Lyonsdale Biomass, LLC	Other Suppliers	Ralston , William	Hebel , Nathan	Carrigan , Kathleen							
Mercuria Energy America, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Davis , Andrew	✓Younger, Mark								
Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Murray, Patrick	Kochonies, Karen	Ezickson, Doron							
NRG Power Marketing Inc.	Other Suppliers	✓Joseph , Kelli	Fuller , Peter	Cona , Lisa							
New York Transco	Other Suppliers	Nachmias, Stuart	Hitti , Nabil	Caso , Rob	Carrigan , Kathleen	Dumais , Paul					
NextEra Energy	Other Suppliers	Applebaum, David	Gardner , Michelle								
Noble Americas Gas & Power Corp.	Other Suppliers	Boston , Roy	Kyle , Chris	✓Sunga , Leonard							
Ontario Power Generation, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Lacivita, Ken	Gell, Richard	Barr, David	Sheinfield , Joel						
PSEG Energy Resource & Trade, LLC	Other Suppliers	✓Fromer, Howard	DePillo , Raymond	Messmer , Robert	Murawski , James						
Riverbay Corporation	Other Suppliers	Merola , Peter	Ellison , Noel	Ahrens, David	Villegas , Cristina						
SESCO Enterprises, LLC	Other Suppliers	Schubiger, Michael	Thoresen, James								
Shell Energy North America, LLC	Other Suppliers	Picardi, Matt									
Talen Energy	Other Suppliers	Hyzinski , Tom	Labella , Julie								
TransCanada Power Marketing, Ltd.	Other Suppliers	Taylor, William	D'Andrea, James	Congel, Dan	Hachey, Mike						
Viridity Energy, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Freifeld , Allen									
Vitol Inc.	Other Suppliers	Wadsworth , Joe	Viola , Bob	Kam , Kenney							
XO Energy NY, LP	Other Suppliers	Drangula , Carey	Thompson , Matthew	Hughes , Adam							

Organization	Sector	Representative	Alternate1	Alternate2	Alternate3	Alternate4	Alternate5	Alternate6	Alternate7	Proxy	Guest
Fluent Energy	Non Voting	Acampora , Peter	Doll , Ed								
Hudson River Energy Group	Non Voting	Radigan, Frank	Canfield, Richard								
Hydro-Quebec TransEnergie	Non Voting	Prevost , Michel									
ITC Mid-Atlantic Development LLC	Non Voting	Wrenbeck , Tom	Benedict , Nathan								
Iberdrola Renewables Inc	Non Voting	Allen, Thresa									
Innovari, Inc.	Non Voting	Lunt , Robin	Hodges , Brent								
MAG Energy Solutions, Inc.	Non Voting	Pelletier , Simon	Veziina, Alexandre								
NRG Curtailment Solutions, Inc.	Non Voting	✓Popova , Julia	✓Ainspan , Malcolm	Pieniasek, Marie							
NYS Department of Public Service	Non Voting	✓Paynter , Thomas	Evans , Adam								✓Michaels, Alan
National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation	Non Voting	Novak , Michael	Eck , Robert								
New Athens Generating Co. LLC	Non Voting	DeVinney, Dan									
Noble Americas Energy Solutions	Non Voting	Sun , Jungsuk	Nakhonthap , Jade	✓Sunga , Leonard							
Northeast Clean Heat & Power Initiative	Non Voting	Venkataraman , Sree	Lilian , Jon	Dwyer , Herb	Brown, Ruben	Cinadr , Matt	Martin , Nicholas	Villegas , Cristina			
Northline Utilities LLC	Non Voting	McKinney , Jeff	Danskin , Susan								
NuEnergen	Non Voting	Hamilton , Sandy	Korczykowski , Ryan								
Power Supply Services LLC	Non Voting	Phillips , Gabriel	Abend , Erik								
RBC Energy Services, LP	Non Voting	Burnham , Steve	Fraiture , Christian	Doolittle , Robin							
RENEW Northeast	Non Voting	Pullaro , Francis	Krich , Abigail								
RES Americas, Inc.	Non Voting	Fernandes , John	Boyd , Dan								
Red Wolf Energy Trading, LLC	Non Voting	Sharma , Rishi									
Richard P. Felak	Non Voting	Felak, Rich									
Saracen Energy East LP	Non Voting	Peebles , Andy									
Siemens Energy, Inc.	Non Voting	Feltes , James									
SolarCity Corporation	Non Voting	Watson , Betty	Khan , Jamil	Reinhardt , Jessica							
Stephentown Spindle, LLC	Non Voting	Hebert , Chris									
Taylor Biomass Energy, LLC	Non Voting	Taylor , Jim	Page , Allan								
Tesla Motors, Inc.	Non Voting	Burson , Kate	Van Cleve , Sarah								
TransAlta Energy Marketing (U.S.) Inc.	Non Voting	Nivolianitis , Ted									
Transmission Developers Inc.	Non Voting	Jessome , Donald	Helmer , William								
William P. Short	Non Voting	Short, William	Schaefer, Marc		Savage, Paul	Verna, Jim					